

EXPERT CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY

“TEXTBOOKS AND WAR: EDUCATIONAL LITERATURE IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION AS A TOOL FOR DESTROYING THE IDENTITY OF UKRAINIANS”



EXPERT CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY

**“TEXTBOOKS AND WAR:
EDUCATIONAL LITERATURE IN
THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION AS
A TOOL FOR DESTROYING THE
IDENTITY OF UKRAINIANS”**

Kyiv
August 2023

Authors: Valentyna Potapova, Mykyta Petrovets
General editing: Valentyna Potapova
Copy editing: Maryna Budzar
Layout and design: Maksym Afanasiev –

Expert conclusions of the study **“Textbooks and war: educational literature in the Russian Federation as a tool for destroying the identity of Ukrainians”**

/ V. Potapova, M. Petrovets. – Kyiv: CCE Almenda, 2023. – 20 p



The material was prepared within the framework of the project “From Fixation to Justice: Ensuring War Crimes to be Properly Documented”, implemented by the Regional Center for Human Rights with the financial support of the International Renaissance Foundation. The material reflects the position of the authors and does not necessarily coincide with the position of the International Renaissance Foundation.

English design of this material and its printing were prepared by the Center of Civic Education “Almenda” as a part of the project “Steps towards the meeting: bringing youth from temporarily occupied territories closer to reintegration”. The project is implemented with the financial support of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Czech Republic as a part of the Transition Promotion Program. The views represented in this material belong to the authors and do not reflect the official position of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Czech Republic.



The full text of the study in Ukrainian is available at [the link](#):

Materials of relevance for criminal proceedings as evidence of the destruction of the Ukrainian identity of children in the occupied territories are available at the same link from the page 30 (in Ukrainian)

Contact for comments and suggestions
Email: info@almenda.org

EXPERT CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY

Children in the occupied territories of Ukraine, as well as those deported to the Russian Federation, are placed in the Russian educational environment, where they are forced to study according to Russian standards, programmes, and educational materials and *become objects of the “re-educating processes” conducted by the Russian state.*

Moreover, the Russian system of patriotic education, which is currently being arbitrarily implemented in the occupied Ukrainian territories, is aimed at forming a Russian civic identity, the introduction of Russian traditional values and a loyal attitude to the military actions unleashed by Russia on the territory of Ukraine. The decrees of the President of the Russian Federation position patriotic education as one of the main means to achieve Russia’s strategic goals.¹ At a meeting with young scientists on 1 December 2022, Vladimir Putin pointed out that Russia needs to gain a foothold in new territories not only militarily and politically, but also by working with people to make them understand the benefits of becoming part of the Russian Federation.²

However, the authors of the study did not aim to evaluate the system of patriotic education in the Russian Federation, because, as the Ukrainian human rights community has repeatedly stressed,³ the very existence of such a system is not unlawful as part of the domestic policy of any state. The main challenge is that this system is being implemented not within the internationally recognised borders of the Russian Federation, but in the occupied Ukrainian territories, which is already a violation of international humanitarian law.

The integration of the temporarily occupied territories of Ukraine into the educational and scientific sphere of the Russian Federation⁴ and the introduction of the Russian legal system to all educational institutions, including general secondary education, allowed the occupation authorities to begin the process of “forming a Russian identity” among schoolchildren and, as a result, to destroy the Ukrainian one.

Under these conditions, Russian textbooks, as part of the educational system in the occupied territories, have a great potential for “educating” a person whose values meet the criteria manifested by the ideology of the Russian Federation:

1 How the law “On Patriotic Education” contributes to the erasure of Ukrainian civic identity among Crimean children. A detailed analysis: <https://almenda.org/yak-zakon-pro-patriotichne-vixovannya-spriyaye-stirannyu-ukrainskoi-gromadyansko%09identichnosti-u-krimskix-ditej/>

2 “Sirius” held a meeting between Vladimir Putin and young scientists - Russia 24 online. Access mode: <https://rutube.ru/video/f610be0ccc59615112aa99d70fbf0429/>

3 How the Law “On Patriotic Education” contributes to the erasure of Ukrainian civic identity among Crimean children. Detailed analysis. Access mode: <https://culture.voicecrimea.com.ua/uk/iak-zakon-pro-patriotychne-vykhovannia-spryaie-styranniu-ukrainskoi-hromadianskoi-identychnosti-u-krymskykh-ditej-detalnyj-analiz/>

4 How Russia violates the right to education during the occupation: qualification under international law. Access mode: <https://almenda.org/yak-rosiya-porushuye-pravo-na-osvitu-pid-chas-okupaci%09kvalifikaciya-za-mizhnarodnim-pravom/>

Firstly, they enable the purposeful formation of a system of values that connects society with the individual and makes him/her a subject of social relations;

Secondly, the values (social, economic, moral) formed with the help of psychological and pedagogical techniques will guide the selection of goals, means, and conditions of activity;

Thirdly, the values embedded in the content of textbooks become the systemic core of the activity scenario and the basis of the inner life of a person.⁵

Aware of the importance of educational content *as a significant factor in the formation and development of the individual, as an integral part of the socio-cultural environment in which people live*, on 12 September 2022, the State Duma Committee on Education supported a draft law to introduce unified general education programmes in schools, which are developed and approved by the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation.⁶

In 2022, the Russian Ministry of Education *strengthened control over the content of textbooks* by introducing a mandatory federal work programme for education and a federal calendar plan for educational work. In addition, the government has begun updating certain documents regulating the content of education (standards, curricula, etc.). For example, on 23 October 2020, a new Concept for teaching 'History of Russia' course in educational organisations of the Russian Federation was adopted,⁷ which formed the basis for new history textbooks.⁸

According to this goal, the Concept aims to improve the quality of school historical education, foster *citizenship and patriotism*. Among the main objectives, the authors of the Concept point to *the exclusivity of the History course for the formation of Russian civic identity and patriotism, and the engagement with the historical memory of many generations of Russians*.

The concept defines the educational and educating potential of the History course, in particular the importance of such worldview tasks as:

- revealing the originality and uniqueness of Russian history, its connection with the leading processes of world history;
- defining the special role of historical knowledge in the formation of *a all-Russian identity and patriotism* in the younger generation;
- fostering in young people a sense of *involvement in the fate of the country*, an active life position and a sense of *civic responsibility*
- educating students in the spirit of patriotism and *respect for their homeland*;
- promoting students' awareness of *their social identity in a broad sense: first and foremost, as citizens of Russia*.

5 Content of modern school education. Access mode: <https://osvita.ua/school/method/787/>

6 The State Duma Committee supported the draft law on the introduction of uniform general education programmes in schools. Access mode: <https://tass.ru/obschestvo/15729939>

7 The concept of teaching the course "History of Russia" in general education institutions of the Russian Federation, implementing basic general education programmes. Access mode: <https://vestnik.edu.ru/uploads/files/2af8f200babe89969f744abd9daccff3.pdf>

8 Author's note: *These textbooks are the subject of the study.*

Thus, one of the main objectives of the school history course is the formation of a civic all-Russian identity, a necessary condition for which is to emphasise the *idea of citizenship* in textbooks, primarily to address the problems of interaction between the state and society, society and the authorities.⁹

The updated historical and cultural standard of the Russian Federation¹⁰ specifically states that it is desirable to “focus on mass heroism in the wars of liberation, especially the Patriotic Wars of 1812 and 1941-1945. It is considered essential to position the feat of the people as “*an example of high citizenship and self-sacrifice for the sake of the Motherland*” hence the textbook should be based on the thesis “Russia is the largest country in the world <...> *we are citizens of a great country with a great past*”.

To create the content of textbooks, their authors are “strongly recommended” to emphasise that “being part of the Russian Empire had a positive impact on its peoples: *security from external enemies, cessation of internal strife and infighting, economic development, spread of education, healthcare, etc.,*” and “the *history of religions, especially Orthodoxy, should be taught systematically and cover the entire content of the textbook.*”

In the realities of the active phase of the Russian-Ukrainian war, on 9 November 2022, to strengthen the role of the state in shaping worldview values, the Russian President signed a decree on the “Fundamentals of State Policy for the Preservation and Strengthening of Traditional Russian Spiritual and Moral Values”.¹¹ As stated in the preamble of the document, it is the basis for strategic planning *in the field of national security of the Russian Federation*. The document identifies “*patriotism, citizenship, service to the Motherland and responsibility for its fate*” as traditional values that shape the worldview of Russian citizens.

Also, according to the decree, ideological control over the worldview of citizens is an integral part of the national security of the Russian Federation, and its implementation requires the introduction of urgent measures, including the following:

- improving the *forms and methods of educating and education of children and youth in accordance with the goals of the state policy* to preserve and strengthen traditional values;
- strengthening the civic unity, *all-Russian civic identity ...* ;
- preserving of historical memory, countering attempts to falsify history ...;
- protection and support of the Russian language *as the language of the state-forming people ...*

Even a cursory glance at the strategic objectives of the Russian Federation in the field of education reveals attempts ***to educate a universal Russian citizen of the “Great Power” with the ability to sacrifice for the sake of serving the Motherland.***

9 Historical and cultural standard. Access mode: <http://surl.li/kaead>

10 Historical and cultural standard. Access mode: <http://surl.li/kaead>

11 Decree of the President of the Russian Federation of 09.11.2022 No. 809. Access mode: <http://www.kremlin.ru/acts/bank/48502?fbclid=IwAR2y7aVIWeFER9l2PmL0KlOqo8Sw2P5hHE0gcn2T9T0-yuoLpcQ2hiVIWeY>

Unfortunately, **more than a million Ukrainian children** are under occupation in the grip of the Russian education system, under the pressure of its powerful civic and educational potential.¹²

NARRATIVES AS A COMPLEX OF SYSTEMIC PEDAGOGICAL AND EDUCATIONAL INFLUENCES AIMED AT “RE-EDUCATING” UKRAINIAN SCHOOLCHILDREN

The authors studied the content of 23 textbooks and identified *Russian pro-government narratives* that are being implemented through the school system in the temporarily occupied territories in order to form “civic feelings” and promote the above-mentioned educational outcome.

It should be noted that the spread of pro-government ideological narratives in the public consciousness is a typical tool of social engineering; their systematic and targeted use allows for the formation of the social position, worldview, values and beliefs necessary for the authorities. According to Georgy Pocheptsov, a well-known expert on communication technologies, a narrative is a complex frame, a cognitive structure that organizes a person's worldview and event perceptions and ideas about the world.¹³

Thus, the narratives disseminated in textbooks become the ideological basis on which a personal model of the world emerges in the minds of students, which includes a person's ideas about *who is their enemy and who is their friend*, what are his or her life goals, and what awaits him or her.

Narratives, which permeate the content of school education, play a crucial role in transmitting knowledge about events and phenomena to students. They accumulate and preserve collective memory, improve a person's understanding of their identity and the cultural identity of society as a whole.¹⁴

Given that we are talking about “Russian identity”, the result of the influence of these narratives should not be seen as educating Russian schoolchildren as patriots of their country, but as the manipulation of the consciousness and worldview of Ukrainian children who were “annexed” by the Russian Federation.

Therefore, the authors of the study considered the value narratives of the Russian Federation *as a system of pedagogical and educational influences aimed at “re-educating” Ukrainian schoolchildren, i.e., convincing them that they are “Russians”, and instilling in them a peremptory “Russian-civic” type of thinking.*

12 Note: data obtained from open sources of the occupation authorities in the temporarily occupied Ukrainian territories

13 Political Encyclopaedia. Access mode: <https://archive.org/details/Politychna/page/n475/mode/2up?view=theater>

14 Narrative: what is it, its essence, definition, types, types and examples of narratives. Access mode: <https://termin.in.ua/naratyv/>

Among the narratives, researchers define the concept of a “grand narrative”¹⁵ that shapes our worldview, our perception of the world, history and social processes. **Grand narratives are essential for individuals to understand their own identity**, their place in history and their role in society. They influence our vision of the past, present and future, and shape our values, beliefs and guidelines.

It is the grand narratives that are represented in the strategies and concepts of patriotic education of the Russian Federation and other related normative documents. And it is them that, *through manipulation of consciousness and support for the dominance of the occupying country’s ideology, pose a threat of destroying Ukrainian identity among schoolchildren and residents of the temporarily occupied territories.*

The content analysis of 23 textbooks for all educational levels, i.e. primary, basic (secondary), and senior, revealed a number of grand narratives that could lead to the replacement of children’s Ukrainian national identity with Russian one. These narratives are:

- *The Russian ethnic group and its culture are the unifying components of the multinational Russian nation;*
- *Your country is the Russian Federation, your people are Russian;*
- *Ukrainian important personalities are actually figures of Russian history and culture;*
- *The Russian language is the only great tool for interethnic communication;*
- *Violation of the unity of the multinational people of the Russian Federation threatens its territorial integrity;*
- *Brotherhood and unity of the Russian people;*
- *The state of Ancient Rus’ is the Russian state;*
- *Identification of the USSR with the Russian Federation;*
- *The importance of being a patriot of the Russian Federation;*
- *The policy of colonisation contributed to the expansion and strengthening of the state;*
- *Defending one’s own national aspirations equals to nationalism, condoning genocide, fascism;*
- *Nationalism is the antithesis of patriotism;*
- *Militarisation / mythologisation / glorification of war;*
- *Extremism, terrorism and fascism as a threat to Russia and the world;*
- *Opposition of the Russian Federation/Russia to the “collective West” and the USA;*
- *The “greatness of Russia” and its “special mission”;*
- *Formation of a positive attitude towards the leadership of the Russian Federation/“USSR” as the personification of the state;*
- *Formation of a positive attitude towards the “Russian Orthodox” church;*

15 Narrative: what is it, its essence, definition, types, types and examples of narratives. Access mode: <https://termin.in.ua/naratyv/>

- *Formation of a positive attitude towards a “strong state/authority”, towards dictatorship;*
- *Power implies the necessary total control over citizens.*

The identified narratives confirmed the findings of the studies “**School Education: Russia’s Hidden Weapon Against Ukraine**”¹⁶ and “**The History of Ukraine in Russian School History Textbooks**”.¹⁷



Some of the narratives are combined into the so-called “all-Russian identity” cluster. The basis for the formation of the “all-Russian identity” are narratives about fraternal peoples, about the existence of historical and cultural ties between them and Russia, in which Russia plays a major role. The Russian Federation is also portrayed as the sole and exclusive heir to Rus’, and all of the latter’s heritage, including cultural sites, figures, and their achievements, also belong to Russia. The issue of language is fundamental to the content of this narrative, as only the Russian language plays a unifying role for fraternal peoples, their cultures and traditions, it “*binds the fraternal family together*”.

The narrative of “*all-Russian identity*” is logically embedded in the narrative of patriotism. All people living on the territory of the Russian Federation and under its control are positioned as bearers of Russian identity. This “logically” leads to the so-called “*sacred duty of the Russian person*” – to defend the Motherland in arms in military service.

The narrative of “*all-Russian identity*” is revealed through the “greatness of Russia and the Russian language”. The adjective “great” is used in almost every paragraph of the textbooks, from primary school to high school. Sometimes it looks strange and ridiculous, for example, “*The electric candle’ of A.N. Yablochkov <...> His ‘Russian light’ <...> illuminated the most beautiful buildings in almost all European capitals.*”¹⁸

But the narrative “*Russian is the great and only language for interethnic communication*” is particularly noteworthy. In general, the language issue is fundamental to the content of this narrative, as only the “Russian language” plays a consolidating role in uniting fraternal peoples, their cultures and traditions, i.e. “binds the fraternal family”. Moreover, the textbook for the 11th grade contains a statement about “the Russian language as *the language of the state-forming people*...” It is worth noting here that the neologism “state-forming people” is taken from the 2020 Constitution of the Russian Federation, which can be interpreted as meaning that the “state-forming” is the group of citizens for whom this language is native and who speak it. The claim of “protecting the Russian-speaking population” on the territory of Ukraine as a “justification” for Russian aggression against Ukraine then sounds quite reasonable.

16 Study “School education: a hidden weapon of the Russian Federation against Ukraine” / N. Vaskivska, K. Kornienko, D. Pidhorna, M. Petrovets, – Kyiv, 2023. Access mode: <https://rchr.org.ua/analytics/shkilna-osvita-pryhovana-zbroya-rf-proty-ukrayiny/>

17 Analytical review “The History of Ukraine in Russian School History Textbooks” by V. Yaremchuk, A. Smirnov – Kyiv, 2023. Access mode: <https://almenda.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/02/Analitchnyy-ohlyad-Istoriya-Ukrayiny-v-rosiyskykh-shkilnykh-pidruchnykh-z-istoriyi.pdf>

18 General history. History of modern times. 9th grade: Textbook for institutions of compulsory education / A.Ya.Yudovskaya et al.: ed. A.A. Iskanderova. – Moscow: Education, p. 24

However, the manifestation of patriotism as the highest “*value of a Russian*” should not be equated with “nationalism”. The latter concept is mostly identified with the concepts of “Nazism” and “chauvinism”, i.e. it is used exclusively with negative connotations. Such rhetoric helps to justify Russia’s war against Ukraine, as it is much easier for children to agree with the “legitimacy” of the motives for aggression.



Another cluster of narratives can be conditionally defined as “glorification of war”. In order to form a positive attitude of Ukrainian children to military service in the Russian Federation, many examples of “military feat” are given, the Russian army is glorified, and high moral virtues are attributed to it. In addition, children are told about the benefits of service in the Russian armed forces, its prestige and the guarantees that await those who join the Russian army. It aims to develop in children an attitude towards the army as an extremely favourable environment for personality development and towards military service as a suitable option for a life scenario.

To convert children more easily to the postulates of Russia’s aggressive foreign policy, the educational materials provide information that proves the permissibility, and sometimes even the necessity, of Russia’s territorial expansion and the expansion of its borders for the sake of the prosperity of a powerful state.

It is worth noting that the seizure of foreign territories, described in school textbooks as a legitimate phenomenon, always has an explanation. The origins of such justifications are either “the hoary antiquity” or “historical necessity”. The territorial acquisitions of the Russian Empire at the end of the eighteenth century are presented as the return of lands that were “part of Rus’ under the first Ruriks”. In other words, students are led to believe that Russia was actually returning “its own”, once lost. During the course of their history studies, Russian students are constantly being taught the idea of a state space whose borders are constantly expanding. In school textbooks, the expansion of territories is presented primarily as a continuation of the actions of princes, tsars, imperial nobility, Bolshevik leaders, whose actions have had and still have the support of the people.

The territorial changes described in school textbooks are primarily represented as “joining” and “accession”. This applies to the Ukrainian Livoberezhzhia (Left Bank Areas) and the Zaporozhian Sich;¹⁹ the territories between the Southern Bug and Dnipro, the lands of Kabarda and the North Caucasus; the acceptance of the Georgian people into “eternal allegiance” in 1801; the Crimea’s “joining” Russia, etc.²⁰

The spread of Russian influence to new territories and the assimilation of peoples who lived in the territories conquered by the aggressor are considered worthy causes. At the same time, the collapse of the USSR should be perceived by children as a tragedy that divided a single multinational nation. That is why Russia has the right and even the obligation to influence newly independent states. There is also an excessive emphasis on the fact that a significant proportion of Russians live in these countries, and the Russian language is quite widespread. In the event of “threats” allegedly “emanating” from these states, such

19 History of Russia.7th grade: Textbook : Part 2 / N.M. Arseniev, A.A. Danilov, I.V. Kuruin (and others) : edited by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p.70-72

20 Arsentiev N. M.: Textbook on the History of Russia – 8th grade – Part 2, p. 40-42

as “violations of the rights of the Russian-speaking population”, aspirations to join NATO, and “development of weapons of mass destruction”, Russia not only has the right but the obligation to use military force.

These narratives are also capable of shaping Ukrainian children’s positive attitudes towards the Russian army, justifying Russia’s imperialist policy in general and in the context of armed aggression against Ukraine. Such narratives and the consequences of absorbing their meaning by Ukrainian children pose a threat of further involvement of Ukrainian youth in military service in the Russian Federation, and of young Ukrainians’ possible participation in armed conflicts against third countries, and even against their own homeland, Ukraine.



The group of narratives “Forming a positive attitude towards the leadership of the Russian Federation/’USSR’ and the state”, “Forming a positive attitude towards a ‘strong state/authority’, towards dictatorship”, “Power is unlimited and necessary control over citizens”, “Forming a positive attitude towards the ‘Russian Orthodox’ church” aims to form respect for any actions of the authorities, the idea of the ‘divine’ origin of power among students in the occupied territories and, most importantly, requires blind obedience to the authorities. Any manifestation of the “subjectivity” of citizens is seen either as a manifestation of extremism, nationalism, or as an attempt to harm the “great Russian people”.

The “image of the tsar” from the History textbook for 7th grade is a eloquent of the validity of this thesis: *“Orthodox people saw the tsar as a protector and support, they addressed complaints to him. The holy duty of the tsar was to pray for Russia <...> the will of the sovereign was perceived as law. And even if the tsar made a mistake, it was only the fault of cunning and self-serving counsellors, boyars and nobles, and the common man had no right to condemn his sovereign...”*.²¹

Even Stalin’s repressions almost disappear from textbooks. For example, in the 2012 edition, four pages were devoted to repressions, while in the 2022 textbook edited by Torkunov, only one and a half pages remained. But the main thing is that the interpretation of the topic has changed dramatically. While previously the authors used to provide statistical data on repressions, the text of the new version of the textbook makes one to get the impression that the repressions concerned only “representatives of the bourgeois and petty-bourgeois strata of the population.”

Meanwhile, Stalin’s activity is presented as extremely necessary when there was a “complication of the international situation”. “The country’s leadership analysed the mistakes and failures of military actions of the Red Army”; “Stalin said ...”; “Stalin believed ...”; “Stalin gave the order”; “Stalin signed ...”; “The plan to defeat the enemy at Stalingrad (it was developed under the leadership of Stalin ...)”; “Stavka provided a significant superiority ...”; “The war hardship was a severe test for the system of government, the entire political system of the USSR, created in the 30s. Despite the strategic errors and miscalculations of the pre-war period, the Soviet top leadership was able to establish a system of rigid but effective party state administration.”²²

21 History of Russia. 7th grade: Textbook : Part 2 / N.M. Arseniev, A.A. Danilov, I.V. Kurukin (and others) : edited by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 107

22 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others) : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 19.

It is worth mentioning in particular the blatant praise of Putin and his policy: “V. V. Putin. With his accession to the leadership of the executive branch, the development of a fundamentally new economic strategy of the country began...”, “In March 2004, continuing the line of strengthening the vertical of power, the President announced the beginning of administrative reform”, “Since then, thanks to the decisive actions of the Russian state, President of Russia V.V. Putin, the number of terrorist attacks committed in our country has decreased to a few cases.”²³

Criticism is also found in textbooks, but, just like in Soviet textbooks, it is targeted at external enemies.



The confrontation between Russia and the countries of the “collective West” and the United States of America is another group of narratives that influences the formation of Ukrainian children’s ideas about the world and the distribution of forces on the political map of the world. The textbooks are consistent with the representation of other countries either as inferior to “Great Russia” or as its enemies. It is also worth highlighting the significant number of negative assessments of the history of other peoples and countries, their development, and their state policies. For example, the processes of colonisation and the formation of colonial empires are seen as negative phenomena, and the methods of colonisation are described only through the description of “brutal suppression of national resistance”. At the same time, identical processes in the history of Russia are interpreted either as a positive phenomenon for the “peoples of Russia” or in the light of such discourse as the geopolitical interests of the “Russian people”.

The textbooks position the phenomena of “extremism, terrorism and fascism” as not typical for Russian society, and if they do occur sporadically, it is only as a result of external interference by foreign states: “They turned the territory of Chechnya into a springboard for the collapse of the Russian Federation. They received financial and military assistance from abroad, and mercenaries from other countries were involved in the gangs”.²⁴

These narratives are particularly emphasized in the high school textbooks, which introduce the concept of the “polar world”. For example, in a subparagraph of the Russian history textbook “**Russia’s Relations with the United States and the West**”, students can read that “*only one superpower has survived - the United States, and the administration of President George W. Bush has set out to change the balance of power on the world stage in its favour...*” and then discuss with the teacher the issue of a “unipolar world” and the strategy for ensuring Russia’s national security²⁵ in the face of increasing military threats and power pressure from NATO.²⁶

23 History. History of Russia, 1946 – beginning of XXI century: 11th grade: Basic level: Textbook for institutions of compulsory education: Part 2 / A.A. Danilov, A.V. Torkunov, O.V. Khlebnikov : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 87-90

24 History. History of Russia, 1946 – beginning of XXI century: 11th grade: Basic level: Textbook for institutions of compulsory education: Part 2 / A.A. Danilov, A.V. Torkunov, O.V. Khlebnikov : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 102

25 History. History of Russia, 1946 – beginning of XXI century: 11th grade: Basic level: Textbook for institutions of compulsory education: Part 2 / A.A. Danilov, A.V. Torkunov, O.V. Khlebnikov : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 106

26 Khrennikov B. O. Health and Safety Basic Course, 9th grade: Textbook / B. O. Khrennikov, N. V. Gololyubov, L. I. L'njanaja. – Moscow: Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 50-51

In this way, Ukrainian children in the Russian educational space develop a constant attitude towards Russia as a state that must be defended from countless external “enemies”, and therefore both preparation for war and the war itself are perceived as extremely necessary and normal processes.



Ukraine in Russian textbooks. Russia’s occupation policy in the field of education is aimed at cleansing and further destroying the Ukrainian studies component, so the authors of the study also considered **the presence of the topic “Ukraine” in textbooks.**

First of all, it is worth noting that “Ukraine” is seen as a part of Russia and is almost devoid of subjectivity. The state of Kyivan Rus’ has disappeared from history textbooks, replaced by the “Ancient Russian State”, the Hetmanate of Ukraine has disappeared and been replaced by the Zaporizhzhya Army, the Ukrainian people have almost disappeared, instead we speak of the Ukrainian population or Little Russians, and Ukrainian cultural figures are positioned as belonging to Russian cultural content.

For example, the history of Ukrainians in the twentieth century is portrayed only in separate episodes against the background of “grandiose” events: “The Great Russian Revolutions - February and October”, “Formation of the USSR”, “The Great Turning Point. Industrialisation”, “Collectivisation of Agriculture”, “Soviet National Policy”, “The Great Patriotic War”, etc. Students will clearly know that the emergence of the Bolsheviks in Ukraine was due to “a request from the Ukrainian Soviet government to fight the Central Rada”;²⁷ and the root causes of the famine of 1932-1933 (precisely the famine, not the Holodomor!) were “the destruction of livestock by peasants who did not want to give it to the collective farm, ... unfavourable natural conditions” and only to a lesser degree “the policy of the authorities”.²⁸ The consequences of the “famine” are presented in a categorical and laconic manner: “Up to 7 million people died of hunger in various parts of the USSR”.²⁹

Ukrainian figures who sought to restore Ukrainian statehood are portrayed as traitors or nationalists.

As for the description of Ukrainians, while talking about the 17th century, they were designated as a people who made up 15% of the total population of Russia, in the middle of the 18th century they were called Little Russians, in the second half of the 19th century they were referred to as Ukrainians, and in the 20th century they were called the part of the “Soviet people”. The knowledge that students receive about Ukrainians mostly remains in the folklore and ethnographic realm, signs of everyday life, housing, clothing, food, etc.

In addition, the territory of Ukraine is viewed in the textbooks as an “arena of geopolitical interests”, where the advantage is always on the side of Russia, as a country that has a “historical right” to it, supported by the population. *“However, on 14 December 1918, power in Kiev was seized by the bourgeois-nationalist Directory headed by V. K. Vinnichenko and S.*

27 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook : Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others): ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 72

28 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level : Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others) : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 139

29 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade : Basic level: Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others) : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 139

V. Petliura. In February 1919, Soviet troops occupied Kiev, and later the territory of Ukraine became the arena of confrontation between the Red Army and the army of A. I. Denikin. In 1920 Polish troops invaded Ukraine. Neither the Germans, nor the Poles, nor Denikin's White Army enjoyed the support of the population. National governments - the Central Rada and the Directory - did not have mass support either."³⁰ The annexation of Crimea in 2014³¹ (Reunification of Crimea and Sevastopol with Russia) was considered in the same context.

Thus, schoolchildren under occupation have a strong feeling that Ukraine is an artificial entity, always used as an arena for geopolitical struggle between Russia and the collective West and the United States. The combination of such an image of Ukraine in textbooks with the above mentioned narratives **creates motivational conditions for Ukrainian children to change their national identity.**

The authors of the study additionally considered the **tools of psychological and pedagogical influence of textbook narratives** on the worldview of children under occupation. In order to realise the goals of personally orientated education, according to O. Bondarevska's concept,³² the content of education should include the following components: *axiological* - introduction of students to the world of values and assistance in choosing a personally significant system of values; *cognitive* - ensuring mastery of scientific knowledge about a human, culture, history, nature, noosphere as the basis for the spiritual development of the student; *activity-creative* - formation and development of various ways of activity, creative abilities necessary for self-realisation of the individual in work and various types of activity; *personal* - self-knowledge, development of reflective ability, mastering methods of self-regulation, self-improvement and self-actualization.

The Russian textbooks studied by the authors of the report comply with modern didactic principles, performing a range of educational, developmental and educating functions.

The textbook content is evenly distributed in accordance with the curriculum and the Russian state educational standard. The main functions of the textbook are related to the system of didactic principles of scientificity, accessibility, focus, systematicity and consistency, comprehensiveness, connection with life, etc.

The structure of all the studied textbooks includes texts and extra-textual components. According to their didactic functions, **textbook texts** are divided into main, supplementary and explanatory. According to the nature of their reflection of reality and didactic purpose, they contain two types of learning components: theoretical (summarising theoretical and methodological knowledge, identifying patterns of processes and phenomena) and empirical (describing facts, phenomena, events, providing exercises and rules).

30 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others) : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. - Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 74

31 History. History of Russia, 1946 - beginning of XXI century: 11th grade: Basic level: Textbook for institutions of compulsory education: Part 2 / A.A. Danilov, A.V. Torkunov, O.V. Khlebnikov : ed. by A.V. Torkunov. - Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 114-115

32 The concept of personality-oriented education of culturological type E. V. Bondarevskaya. Access mode: http://ni.biz.ua/10/10_9/10_91037_kontseptsiya-lichnostno-orientirovannogo-obrazovaniya-kulturologicheskogo-tipa-ev-bondarevskoy.html

All 23 textbooks contain the following types of texts **according to how the material is presented**:

- a) reproductive texts – highly informative, structured, understandable texts that meet the objectives of explanatory and illustrative teaching;
- b) problem raising texts – texts of monologue form that identify contradictions, solve problems, substantiate the logic of thinking processes;
- c) programmable texts – texts whose content is presented in parts, and the assimilation of each portion of information is checked by control questions;
- d) complex texts – textbook texts that contain certain doses of information necessary for students to understand the problem defined by the logic of problem-based learning;
- e) supplementary texts – texts included in the textbook to expand and enrich students' knowledge of important components of the content of the educational material.

There are also **extra-textual components of the textbook**:

- apparatus for organising learning: questions and tasks, instructional materials (memos, sample solutions to problems, examples), tables, explanatory notes to illustrative material;
- illustrative material: drawings, pictures, diagrams;
- orientation apparatus: introduction, table of contents, bibliography.

According to the degree of cognitive independence of students, all questions and tasks in the textbooks are divided into reproductive (requiring students to reproduce knowledge without significant changes) and productive or creative (involving the transformation of knowledge, significant changes in its structure or the search for new information).

Thus, it can be stated that the analysed textbooks will functionally contribute to the understanding of the semantic content of the concepts being learned, the specification of scientific and cultural concepts, provided they are linked to the life experience of students, and will create conditions for changing the national identity of children under “educational occupation” in the process of developing their motivational sphere.







At the same time, these textbooks have a psychological impact on Ukrainian children, encouraging them to achieve the goals planned by the “manipulators” (textbook authors). This influence can be seen as a socio-psychological phenomenon that allows for a transition from brutal forms of violence to hidden, subtle psychological influences.³³

Therefore, the authors considered it appropriate to characterise the tools of manipulative pressure on the minds of schoolchildren by the above narratives. To do this, the content of textbooks was examined through the methods and techniques of political and psychological influence on the masses and the main psychological means of political manipulation of human consciousness and behaviour in political propaganda.³⁴

33 Psychological protection against manipulative influence. *Bulletin of Taras Shevchenko Kyiv National University*. Military specialized sciences. 2010. Issues 24-25, p. 39-43.

34 Andriushchenko T., Zelenin V. Psychology of political propaganda: methodological recommendations for independent work of students. K.: Gnosis, 2022, 100 p.

Among the main tools of manipulative influence the following are identified:

-  **INFORMING** is an extremely prevalent means of social influence. The content of textbooks is structured in such a way that information is provided in accordance with strategic educational objectives and becomes “distorted” not because it is falsified, but because a significant part of it is hidden. For example, literature textbooks provide information only about Russian writers and devote considerable attention to the study of works about the Great Patriotic War.
-  **MYTHOLOGISING** is the most commonly used tool in textbooks. Among the myths spread by school education are the following: “Russia is a great power”, “The Russian language is great and powerful”, “Russia always wins wars”, “Russia is a peacemaker and defender of peoples”, “Sevastopol is a city of Russian glory”, etc.
-  **INSTILLING** is an indirect psychological influence based on the hidden inducement of a person to perform a certain action by adding motivation to the content of their desires, which adjusts the individual’s life plans. This role in the studied textbooks is played by the narrative of “service to the Motherland”, which can be picked up in all texts. There are even some additional texts in the chapters of history textbooks under the heading “Honour and Glory of the Motherland”. And in literature textbooks, a large block is devoted to the poetry of the “suffering of the Russian emigration”.
-  **CONTAGION AND IMITATION** is a special means of influence that promotes the adoption of other people’s behaviour and is reinforced by the mechanisms of collective emotional interaction. “Along with men of military age, also women, the elderly, and minors rose up to fight the enemy. They not only ensured the work of the home front, but also fought at the front line.”; “As in the First World War, fathers and mothers were helped by children and teenagers to forge victory.”; quote from D. S. Likhachev: “In the famine, people showed themselves, exposed themselves, freed themselves from all tinsel: some turned out to be remarkable, unparalleled heroes, others revealed themselves as villains, scoundrels, murderers, cannibals”; “...heroes who became a symbol of courage and military valour ... Nikolai Gastello, ... Viktor Talalikhin, ... Liza Chaikina, ... Zoya Kosmodemyanskaya, ... Alexander Matrosov, ... 28 Panfilovites”, etc.³⁵ Thus, “educational manipulators” use an individual’s ability to imitate to form certain patterns of human behaviour by demonstrating the actions of those individuals who enjoy people’s trust and authority.
-  **THE METHOD OF “LABELLING”** involves assigning certain properties, signs, characteristics to events, phenomena, people without additional argumentation. In particular, textbooks use this method to construct narratives of “them/us”, nationalists, etc.
-  **“BRAINWASHING” METHOD** is a manipulative tool used to convince a person of the truth of new ideas by changing the ideological and conceptual system of their consciousness. Its purpose is to reformat old and create new knowledge, concepts, and ideas. This method is used to form young people’s “own beliefs” that the only way to save the state is through strong government, not democratic methods of governance. The skilful use of learning management tools (tasks, questions,

35 History. History of Russia, 1914–1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others): ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022

projects) in the textbook helps to strengthen the impact of this method. For example, the section *“Think, compare, reflect”* - 5. *Express your attitude to the opinion of one of the journalists: if there had been no such decisive actions by Boris Yeltsin in 1993, tens of thousands of people would have died as a result of a real civil war. But there are moments in history when it is necessary to interrupt the implementation of democratic procedures in order not to compromise the same democracy in the country for many years to come.*³⁶



THE METHOD OF PERSUASION has the purpose to persuade a person to recognise the truth of values, norms and behavioural patterns communicated by various propaganda tools. Usually, bombastic phrases of generally accepted meaning are used, the very use of which has a convincing effect on the individual: *“...The war you are waging is a war of liberation, a just war. May the courageous image of our great ancestors, Alexander Nevsky, Dmitry Donskoy, Kuzma Minin, Dmitry Pozharsky, Alexander Suvorov, Mikhail Kutuzov, inspire you in this war! May the victorious banner of the great Lenin shine upon you!”*³⁷.



THE EFFECT OF PRESENCE contains a number of elements designed to imitate reality. In textbooks, this method includes project tasks, an example of which is the project *“Gather information about the struggle of the peoples of the USSR against fascism, using, if possible, archival photographs, newsreels, and memoirs of war veterans living in your area. Based on the material you have collected, prepare a class hour with your teacher on the topic “They defended the Motherland...”*³⁸



THE METHOD OF “REWRITING HISTORY” involves distorting true information through covertly false information, when it is difficult to understand how the falsification is carried out. In a history textbook for the 11th grade, the authors devoted a separate paragraph “Falsification of the History of the Great Patriotic War” to this method, explaining to students the essence of falsification (“...a forgery, deliberate distortion, substitution of the genuine, real”) and answering the key question: “Who falsifies history, how and why?”. However, they used the same means of manipulating historical facts and statements that they condemned: “In some countries, *entire ‘institutes of national memory’, special museums, whose maintenance costs are many times higher than those of academic institutions, work in the direction set by the authorities.*”³⁹ The consequences of this method are very effective in the long run, when it is necessary to gradually form an appropriate worldview using the mechanisms of ‘restoring historical truth’ through the patterns of mass memory.

36 History. History of Russia, 1946 – beginning of XXI century: 11th grade: Basic level: Textbook for institutions of compulsory education: Part 2 / A.A. Danilov, A.V. Torkunov, O.V. Khlebnikov: ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 64

37 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others): ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 27

38 History. General History. Modern History, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook / O.S. Soroko-Tsyupa, A.O. Soroko-Tsyupa: edited by A.O. Chubaryan. – Moscow: Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 210

39 History. History of Russia, 1914-1945. 10th grade: Basic level: Textbook: Part 2 / M.M. Gorinov, A.A. Danilov, L.G. Kosulina (and others): ed. by A.V. Torkunov. – Moscow : Prosveshchenie, 2022, p. 108

It should be noted that the textbooks contain separate sections on the interpretation of the concepts of “national idea”, “Russian person”, “denial of the liberation mission of the Red Army”, “the role of the Orthodox Church”, and “special services”.

Also, in the texts of textbooks, the concept of “Russia” is often correlated with words that have positive connotations, inspire confidence, and unite: “we”, “ours”, “together”, “security”, “guarantee”, “victory”, “success”, “ensure”, “peace”, etc. At the same time, words are often used that provoke or intensify negative emotions towards Russia’s opponents, contributing to a sense of instability, hostility, and risk: “danger”, “threat”, “betrayal”, “defeat”, “enemy”, “attack”, “treachery”, “to attack”, etc.

A noticeable role in increasing the emotional impact of textbook texts on the consciousness of students is played by the categorization of concepts - combining them in ambivalent pairs: “own” / “other’s”, “we” / “they”, “good” / “bad”, “fair” / “unjust”, “guilty” / “innocent”, “civilized” / “uncivilized”, etc.

It is worth noting that schooling using specified textbooks takes place in an environment where the possibility of expressing a different opinion or receiving alternative information is limited by the actions of the occupation authorities.⁴⁰ And after a while, students find themselves in a so-called “information bubble” or “filter bubble”, when the circulation of information in a selective and intellectually narrowed circle inevitably leads to the echo chamber effect, which results in the exchange of similar opinions, the exchange of own beliefs, not corrected by alternative opinions, become more categorical, multidimensional analysis of the situation is not foreseen, there is no view of it from a different worldview position. This makes it very difficult to come closer to a true understanding of reality and creates preferences for the *dominance of post-truth* in the communication space. Even with real, including technical, opportunities to go beyond the “information bubble” or “echo chamber”, in most cases, an individuals are in no hurry to leave the zone of their own information comfort, which has become the basis of life stability for them.⁴¹

The authors have considered only a small part of the tools of manipulative influence identified in the study of narratives in Russian textbooks, but it is clear that the problem of the psychological and pedagogical impact of textbooks, content and teaching methods on the minds of Ukrainian children living in the occupied territories requires a separate study.

At the same time, even based on the results of this study, it can be concluded that the long-term education of children under occupation according to Russian standards will contribute to the formation of national (*Russian*) consciousness of the individual, “love for the native land” (Russia), “their people” (*Russian*), and readiness to work (serve) “for the good of the country” (*Russia*).

And the formation through the education system of young people’s awareness of their “*ethnic community (common language, culture, territory) with the Russian Federation*” is a real

40 Analytical report ““Crimean scenario”: How the Russian Federation destroys the Ukrainian identity of children in the occupied territories.” Access mode: <https://almenda.org/analitychnyy-zvit-universalnyy-soldat-2022-2023/>.

41 Viznitsa Y.V. “Problems of researching the phenomenon of “post-truth” in the media and communication space. Social technologies: topical issues of theory and practice.” 2019. Issue 83. p. 93-101. Access mode: <http://elibrary.kdpu.edu.ua/handle/123456789/3650>.

threat to the loss of Ukrainian cultural identity and can be seen as an element of cultural genocide.

ISSUES OF LEGAL QUALIFICATION OF THE ACTIONS OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION IN THE FIELD OF EDUCATION

The narratives and tools of influence identified in the study can become evidence of the criminal actions of the Russian Federation related to the sphere of education, as elements of the aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine, used for the purpose of changing and reformatting the public consciousness of the population of the territories of Ukraine occupied by it.

It should be noted that promoting the transformation of consciousness, changing a person's own identity is a violation of a number of norms of international humanitarian law and international human rights law. The regime of occupation does not grant a sovereign title over the territory, so the Russian Federation has no legal grounds to apply its laws on the occupied territory of Ukraine, in particular to introduce its own educational standards and significantly change the educational process.

At the same time, the question of the legal qualification of the actions of the Russian Federation in the field of education is quite complex. In an article devoted to these issues, Anastasiya Vorobyova, analyst of the NGO "CCE Almenda", points out:⁴²



There is an opinion that Article 50 of the Geneva Convention IV directly prohibits the Occupying Power from interfering in educational activities carried out in the occupied territory, which is related to the temporary nature of the occupation. It can also be argued that the occupier can essentially control only those aspects of the education system in the occupied territory that directly affect the military occupation and the conduct of hostilities. Beyond this point, no intervention is permissible.

This approach is also justified from the point of view of the principle of limited intervention of the Occupying Power in the administration of the occupied territories, according to which attempts to include the educational system of the occupied territories into the all-Russian educational space with the transition to federal Russian education standards, the replacement of textbooks with Russian ones, and the transition to the Russian language in teaching process directly contradict the provisions of IHL. Therefore, the actions of the Russian Federation regarding the destruction of Ukrainian education in the occupied territories are a violation of the rules of occupation, especially considering the fact that fundamental changes in education in the occupied territories lead to irreversible transformations in the consciousness of Ukrainian children, fostering loyalty to the Russian authorities and imposing a Russian identity.

The issue of concern in the context of violations of the norms of international humanitarian law is the legal qualification of the above actions and, accordingly, the subsequent prosecution. In the Rome Statute, there is no separate *corpus delicti*, which would directly relate to

42 How Russia violates the right to education during the occupation: qualification under international law. Access mode: <https://almenda.org/yak-rosiya-porushuye-pravo-na-osvitu-pid-chas-okupaci%d1%97-kvalifikaciya-za-mizhnarodnim-pravom/>

the consequences of unlawful interference in the educational process. However, the structure of international crimes covenanted in the Rome Statute can provide space for their interpretation, which would allow to cover the unlawful practices described above.

One of such crimes is a crime against humanity under Art. 7(1)(h) of the Rome Statute. This crime is “persecution”, that is, “intentional and severe deprivation of fundamental rights contrary to international law by reason of the identity of the group or collectivity.”⁴³ There are examples in the past when this *corpus delicti* covered the practice of denying access to the educational process based on ethnic origin, which strengthens the prospects for legal qualification. At the same time, the described context of an unlawful act makes certain adjustments as the process of proving direct discrimination outside of the widespread commission of other crimes can be problematic.

Another option may be to assess the unlawful actions of the Russian Federation as a potential act of genocide, namely in terms of depriving Ukrainian children of the right to an available, accessible and acceptable Ukrainian education. The actions of the Russian Federation are aimed at replacing the national Ukrainian identity, which in its consequences can be equalled to genocidal acts, particularly when it comes to the “mental” transition of children from one group to another, which potentially can lead to the responsibility under Art. 6(e) of the Rome Statute. Although, at present, this approach has not been given a legal assessment in the practice of the International Criminal Court and other international criminal tribunals, this is not yet evidence of its unfoundedness. Therefore, the actions of the Russian Federation regarding the replacement of the identity of Ukrainian children can theoretically be qualified as having signs of genocide. In any case, these actions can be additional evidence of genocidal intent or an integral element of already existing genocidal actions of the Russian Federation, such as the deportation and adoption of Ukrainian children by Russian families with their subsequent inclusion in the Russian education system.

Also, taking into account the provisions of Art. 50 of Geneva Convention IV of 1949, the actions of the Russian Federation regarding the militarization of Ukrainian children could be considered through the prism of Art. 8(2)(a)(vi), 8(2)(b)(xv) of the Rome Statute, namely as compulsion for military service in an enemy state. At the same time, the current legal paradigm is quite limited, since the formal conscription for military service in the given case is only potential.

Moreover, the Occupying Power is directly responsible for ensuring the realization of the right to education of residents of the occupied territories in the context of international human rights law. The right to education is provided by **Articles 13 and 14 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of 1966** (hereinafter referred to as the Covenant)⁴⁴ and **Article 29 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child of 1989** (hereinafter referred to as the Convention).⁴⁵ It is worth noting that both Ukraine and the Russian Federation are parties to these international agreements, the obligations of states under such agreements are valid not only within their own territory, but all those territories over which their jurisdiction extends, which includes the situation of occupation.

43 Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court. Access mode: <https://www.icc-cpi.int/sites/default/files/RS-Eng.pdf>

44 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Access mode: [International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | OHCHR](#)

45 КОНВЕНЦІЯ про права дитини Режим доступу Convention on the Rights of the Child. Access mode: [Convention on the Rights of the Child | OHCHR](#)

According to *Article 13 of the Covenant and Art. 29 of the Convention* “education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity, and shall strengthen the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms... shall enable all persons to participate effectively in a free society, promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups, and further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.”

Any education, whether public or private, formal or informal, shall be directed at achieving the goals and objectives defined in Article 13,⁴⁶ which also applies to the occupied territories. Education must also meet the requirements of acceptability⁴⁷ – that is, the form and substance of education, primarily curricula and teaching methods, have to be relevant, culturally appropriate and of good quality for those seeking education. The use of educational programs that do not meet the educational goals formulated in Article 13 (1) may be recognized as a *violation of the right to education*. Education introduced by Russia in the occupied territories of Ukraine is not used for the purpose of comprehensive development of the human personality of the education seekers, but instead is a tool of Russian propaganda, a means of replacing the identity of Ukrainian children with Russian one and instilling loyalty to the Occupying Power. In addition, the militaristic component, common for the school programs of all analyzed subjects, is aimed not at maintaining peace, but at educating young people in the constant readiness for war.

You can **read more about the legal assessment of the potential legal qualification** of the considered unlawful actions against Ukrainian children **in the study “School education: a hidden weapon of the Russian Federation against Ukraine”**.⁴⁸

Regarding prosecution for violations of the right to education, unfortunately, the Russian Federation is not a party to the additional protocols that establish the mechanism for submitting individual complaints to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on the Rights of the Child. Instead, the inclusion of the mentioned aspects for consideration within the scope of the UN monitoring mechanisms should contribute to increasing international pressure on the Russian Federation to respect the right of residents of the occupied territories to receive Ukrainian education and preserve their identity. At the same time, these aspects were not considered by the relevant authorities at the time this study was under way.

Currently, the most practically possible is the criminal prosecution of the persons responsible for the implementation of Russian educational programs on the local level. Those high-ranking officials of the federal authorities of the Russian Federation and the military command who directly managed these processes should be brought to justice. Therefore, it is imperative to either develop a set of actions to bring these individuals to justice at the international level or to seek ways to implement such actions through existing mechanisms to provide for an explicit prohibition of these practices and liability in case they are implemented.

46 CESCR General Comment No. 13: The Right to Education (Art. 13) Режим доступу: <https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/4538838c22.pdf>

47 CESCR General Comment No. 13: The Right to Education (Art. 13) Режим доступу: <https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/4538838c22.pdf>

48 Study “School Education: Russia’s Hidden Weapon Against Ukraine” / N. Vaskivska, K. Kornienko, D. Pidhorna, M. Petrovets – Kyiv, 2023. Access mode: <https://rchr.org.ua/analytics/shkilna-osvita-pryhovana-zbroya-rf-proty-ukrayiny/>

